

December 13, 2022

Tahoe Regional Planning Agency Governing Board Submitted via email

Re: Comments on the Latitude 39 Project

Governing Board Chair, Vice Chair, Members, and TRPA staff -

The League to Save Lake Tahoe (League) is providing these comments as a key stakeholder in the development of the vehicle miles traveled (VMT) Threshold Update. The League appreciates the opportunity to continue to work with the Tahoe Regional Planning Agency (TRPA) and local jurisdictions to make sure we as a region are on track to achieve and maintain the VMT Threshold through implementation of the related requirements, in particular the Project Impact Analysis (PIA) tool.

The League is dedicated to protecting and restoring the environmental health, sustainability, and scenic beauty of the Lake Tahoe Basin. In connection with our mission, we support transportation solutions for Tahoe and advocate for the implementation of projects and policies contained within regional land use and planning documents that reduce dependence on the private automobile, including the Bi-State Compact (Compact), the 2012 Regional Plan Update (Regional Plan) and the Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (RTP/SCS).

This is the first year that projects are being proposed under the updated VMT Threshold. During this initial period of VMT threshold implementation it is of utmost importance to ensure that a precedent is set to rigorously evaluate and mitigate impacts to the VMT Threshold. We appreciate TRPA staff's willingness to work with us and the project proponent to take a detailed look at the VMT calculations, however, while the updated transportation analysis is an improvement, the results are still not transparent.

The League believes the November 10th analysis is still an over-estimate of existing VMT and an underestimate of proposed VMT. Mitigation measures as outlined below should be employed for the Latitude 39 project to accurately reflect the project description.

Existing Use Daily Trips and VMT

The first LSC Transportation Consultants, Inc. (LSC) analysis claimed 778 existing daily trips (with 159 trips in the PM peak) for the current use of the Wells Fargo building, after the reductions for non-auto and pass-by trips. The League expressed concerns about this calculation as the use of the building is a single ATM. The single drive-through ATM is approximately 20 square feet. If you include the entire covered area, it is approximately 300 square feet. That's about a 1/3 the size of any bank-related trip rate because they are all based on per-1,000 square foot rates. Those same trip rates are additionally based on studies of drive-through banks with 3-4 lanes, but the current use is just a single lane.

Based on that analysis, we believe that the number of daily trips for the existing use should be reduced 60-70% from the November 10, 2022 analysis.

Proposed Use Daily Trips and VMT

The industry standard Institute of Traffic Engineers (ITE) trip rate for "Single-Family Attached Housing" is #215. The ITE trip rate for multi-family low-rise is #221. The LSC November 10· 2022 analysis uses #221 (multi-family low-rise). According to LSC, the average trip length for multi-family low-rise is 5.44 miles compared to 7.2 for single-family attached); and the difference in daily trips is about 70 more for single-family attached.

There are a number of different factors, including changes made between the October 2021 and November 2022 LSC calculations, that lead to substantial questions about the accuracy of the daily trip and VMT results:

- Using November 2022 numbers, the ITE trip rate for #221 and using the extra 70 trips, you would get an additional 381 VMT. If you used the #215 rate, you would get an additional 400 VMT.
 Either of those scenarios (or even changing the reductions for internal trips, non-auto access, or pass-by rates) would push them over the 1,300 VMT threshold.
- See the attached estimates made by League staff based on public information available. The
 changes made between the two analyses are in red text. Notably, the daily trip rates have
 decreased, and the trip lengths have changed. League staff was not able to recreate the 1,298
 average daily VMT calculation made by LSC.

Based on this information (ITE classifications, reductions, and existing use), the League believes the November 10th analysis is still an underestimate of the proposed VMT.

As a key stakeholder throughout the VMT Threshold update, this project is the type of project that was envisioned to *not* be screened out – instead to go through a full VMT analysis and mitigate impacts and pay the Mobility Mitigation fee. The questionable calculations and changes made between the two analyses resulting in a final net VMT from the project that is *2 VMT* below the threshold is arbitrary, not based on available information, and there is not enough supporting documentation to fully follow, or replicate, the LSC calculations.

Potential Solution

There is a potential mitigation measure in the IEC project description and draft permit conditions for resident and employee shuttles. When revised calculations result in the project exceeding the 1,300 VMT screening threshold, the project proponent can use the shuttles as a mitigation measure instead of just in the project description and would potentially meet the VMT Threshold requirements.

Active Transportation Plan Checklist Concerns

The Active Transportation Checklist is not included in the files for the December 14, 2022 Governing Board meeting, but was shared with the League and is attached to our comments. The League would like to thank TRPA staff for addressing some of our initial concerns with permit conditions (specifics on the required sidewalk and bike racks). We have two remaining concerns:

- No traffic management plan was submitted for construction (bike/ped access) and there is a bike lane on Lake Parkway and a sidewalk on Highway 50. They must submit this plan before starting construction this needs to be a potential permit condition.
- The project is within the "75-foot buffer of existing or proposed active transportation facilities" but the project documentation does not reflect this (see TRPA Transportation Map¹ for 75-foot buffer and proposed bike infrastructure). Accordingly the project must include:
 - Construction of segments of the proposed active transportation network. This would be the shared use path along highway 50.
 - A bike/pedestrian counter (IV.c)
 - Wayfinding (V) and must (reference sheet) connect to the active transportation network.

Potential Solution

The easiest way to address may be to make the existing sidewalk along highway 50 in front of the property a Class I shared use path instead of a sidewalk.

¹ http://gis.trpa.org/transportation/

Long Term Solution

The single remaining piece of the VMT Threshold Update is the Project Impact Assessment (PIA) tool. It exists, but is not yet populated with trip rates for many common land uses, guidance on how to use the tool and choose land uses, or a meaningful number of mitigation measures to choose from. The issue at hand today will occur until TRPA provides guidance to eliminate confusing and conflicting calculations.

The League looks forward to continuing to work with TRPA and the project proponent to ensure that a proper analysis of VMT and subsequent mitigation is completed in this case, and the PIA tool is update in the mid-term. Thank you again for the opportunity to comment on the proposed Project and please do not hesitate to reach out to me directly if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Gavin Feiger

on behalf of the League to Save Lake Tahoe

Senior Land Use Policy Analyst

The initial October 28, 2021 LSC transportation analysis:

TABLE	E . I	atituda	20 Trim	Generation
IABLE	5:1	Latitude	39 ITID	Generation

											١ ٧	/ehicle	Trips			Project G	enerated	l Vehicl	e Trips
				ITE Land	Trip	Genera	tion Rat	es 1		Reduction for	at 9	ite Dri	veway	ys	Percent	on Ar	djacent R	loadwa	ys
			ITE Land Use	Use		Pf	M Peak H	lour	Reduction for	External Non-Auto		PN	1 Peak	Hour	Reduction for	D-II-	PM	l Peak H	lour
Description	Quantity	Units	Category	Code	Daily	In	Out	Total	Internal Trips	Access	Daily	In	Out	Total	Pass-By Trips ²	Daily	In	Out	Total
Proposed Land Uses																1			
Restaurant	3.712	KSF	High Turnover (Sit- Down Restaurant)	932	135.48	6.06	3.71	9.77	10%	40%	272	13	7	20	43%	155	7	4	11
Multi Family Residence	40	DU	Multi Family Housing (Low-Rise)	221	5.44	F	itted Cui	rve	15%	25%	139	8	4	12	0%	139	8	4	12
Total Proposed Project	40	DU									411	21	11	32		294	15	8	23
Previous Land Uses																			
Bank	13.296	KSF	Drive-In Bank	912	100.03	10.23	10.23	20.45	0%	10%	1,197	154	91	245	35%	778	100	59	159
Project Net Impact					•	•			•		-786	-133	-80	-213	•	-484	-85	-51	-136

DU= Dwelling Unit. KSF = 1000 Square Feet

Note 1: TRPA for daily rates. ITE for Peak hour rate.

Note 2: Passby percentages taken from the ITE Trip Generation Handbook 3rd Edition (2017)

Source: LSC Transportation Consultants, Inc., Tahoe Regional Planning Agency (TRPA) Trip Table, and Institute of Transportation Engineers Trip Generation (10th Edition)

The updates November 10, 2022 LASC transportation analysis:

TABLE 5: Latitude 39 Trip Generation

													Trips			Project G			
				ITE Land	Trip	Genera	tion Rat	es ¹		Reduction for	at S	ite Dr	ivewa	/S	Percent	on A	djacent F	toadwa	ys
			ITE Land Use	Use		PI	M Peak H	lour	Reduction for	External Non-		PN	1 Peak	Hour	Reduction for	Daily	PM	Peak H	our
Description	Quantity	Units	Category	Code	Daily	In	Out	Total	Internal Trips	Auto Access	Daily	In	Out	Total	Pass-By Trips ²	Dally	In	Out	Total
Proposed Land Uses																			
Restaurant	3.712	KSF	High Turnover (Sit- Down Restaurant)	932	107.2	5.52	3.53	9.05	10%	40%	215	11	7	18	14%	184	9	6	15
Multi Family Residence	40	DU	Multi Family Housing (Mid-Rise)	221	4.54	F	itted Cu	rve	15%	25%	116	6	5	11	0%	116	6	5	11
Total Proposed Project	40	DU									331	17	12	29		300	15	11	26
Previous Land Uses																			
Bank ATM	1	Lane	Drive-In Bank	912	125.03	13.26	13.81	27.07	0%	10%	113	15	9	24	35%	73	10	6	16
Project Net Impact											218	2	3	5		227	5	5	10

DU= Dwelling Unit. KSF = 1000 Square Feet

Note 1: ITE for Daily and Peak hour rates.

Note 2: Passby percentages taken from the ITE Trip Generation Handbook 3rd Edition (2017). Restaurant pass-by reduction reduced to avoid double-counting reductions with the non-auto reduction.

 $Source: \textit{LSC Transportation Consultants, Inc. and Institute of Transportation Engineers} \ \underline{\textit{Trip Generation}} \ \ (11 th \ \textit{Edition})$

League to Save Lake Tahoe 12/12/2022 comparison of two analyses:

ITE Code		Oct. 2021 Quantity		Oct. 2021	2022	Oct. 2021 Daily trip	Nov. 2022 Daily trip	n for	2022 Reductio n for internal	Oct. 2021 Reductio n for external non-auto	Reductio n for external non-auto	Oct. 2021 reductio	reductio n for pass	vehicle	Daily vehicle		Trip	Nov. 2022 maybe trip lengths used
TTE COUL	restaurant	Quantity	Quantity	Omes	Omes	ruces	ruces	шрэ	unps	шрэ	шро	by trips	by trips	шро	Liips	rengen	rengui	useu
	(high																	
	turnover,																?more	
932	sit-down)	3.712	3.712	KSF	KSF	135.48	107.2	10%	10%	40%	40%	43%	14%	155	184	6.2	specific?	6.2
	MF																	
	residense																	
	(MF low-																?more	
221	rise)	40	40	Units	Units	5.44	4.54	15%	15%	25%	25%	0%	0%	139	116	6.2	specific?	5.44
	Bank (drive																?more	
912	inbank)	13.296	1	KSF	Lane	1200.03	125.03	0%	0%	10%	10%	35%	35%	778	73	6.2	specific?	6.2
	NET Daily	/Trips & VI	MT											-484	227	-3,001	1,298	1,319



Mail PO Box 5310 Stateline, NV 89449-5310

Location 128 Market Street Stateline, NV 89449 **Contact**Phone: 775-588-4547

Fax: 775-588-4527 www.trpa.gov

ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN CHECKLIST FOR CONSIDERATION OF ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION POLICIES

DIRECTIONS

The following Active Transportation Plan (ATP) checklist is designed to ensure project applicants consider and include active transportation programs and facilities into projects where applicable. Applicants should refer to the online resources and the attached ATP Checklist Reference Sheet, which includes policies and provides examples for implementation. For a complete list of definitions, please refer to the *Linking Tahoe: Active Transportation Plan* Glossary on pages 13-16. Use the blank boxes to add any additional information. If more space is required, please attach separate sheets and reference the question number and letter.

This ATP Checklist must be completed by project applicants if the project-specific application checklist identifies the ATP Checklist as required.

Online Resources: To access the *Linking Tahoe: Active Transportation Plan* and other resources needed to complete this checklist, please visit www.trpa.gov and access the "Applications & Forms" page under "Permitting." Links to the Active Transportation Plan Checklist and the Maintenance Responsibilities Chart and Plan are listed under the "Environmental Documentation" section of that page. Additional resources are linked below:

- Maintenance Responsibilities Chart and Plan
- Linking Tahoe: Active Transportation Plan
- Transportation Web Map
- Complete Street Resource Guide
- California Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices
- State Route 28 National Scenic Byway Corridor Signage Master Plan
- Learn more about the Transportation Program

ATP CHECKLIST

<u>l. </u>	PROJECT DESCRIPTION:
	Project Location/Assessor's Parcel Number (APN): 1318-27-001-010
	Project Name: Latitude 39 Residential Condominium & Commercial Mixed-Use Proj.
	County/City: Douglas
<u>II.</u>	FACILITY MAINTENANCE:
	Submit your Maintenance Responsibilities Chart and Plan (attach plan to this checklist prior to submission) If the project contains active transportation facilities (i.e. bike and pedestrian facilities), you are required to fill out and submit the Maintenance Responsibilities Chart and Plan prior to permit issuance. The plan will clarify roles for annual and capital infrastructure operating and maintenance and identify funding needs and possible sources. This information will be included in issued permits.
	View the Maintenance Responsibilities Chart and Plan online.
	Submitted with this checklist
	✓ Not submitted
<u>III.</u>	MULTI-MODAL CONNECTIONS:
	Will the project include facilities that promote and encourage intermodal connectivity? If yes, please describe. Note "intermodal connectivity" is defined as using two or more modes of transportation in a single journey (ex: walking from your house to the bus stop and riding the bus to work). Examples of such facilities include first and last mile trip facilities and infrastructure that aim to improve connectivity between all transportation modal options. Please refer to the attached ATP Checklist Reference Sheet, which lists several methods that may be used to satisfy this checklist item under Policy 3.1 in the 2016 Active Transportation Plan.
L	
	New sidewalk along Lake Parkway adjacent to project site; bicycle parking
[No

IV. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION: a. Provide a detailed traffic management plan for alternate routes to detour bike and pedestrian traffic during project construction. If project construction will impact an active transportation route, projects must adhere to the appropriate Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MUTCD) requirements. The bike and pedestrian traffic management plan must be included on approved plans. All active transportation routes can be found using the TRPA GIS Transportation Web Map: http://gis.trpa.org/transportation/ Submitted with this checklist Not submitted b. Does the project proposal incorporate constructing segments of the proposed active transportation network? If yes, please describe. If the project is within the 75-foot buffer of existing and proposed active transportation facilities, please review the TRPA Code of Ordinances, Section 65.3.2 to determine if active transportation requirements apply. Determine if the project is within the 75-foot buffer of existing or proposed active transportation facilities using the TRPA GIS Transportation Web Map: http://gis.trpa.org/transportation/ If the project is subject to active transportation requirements within the 75-foot buffer, work with your TRPA or local jurisdiction planner to determine how best to adhere to the requirements related to your project. If the project is not within the 75-foot buffer, but you would still like to include a connection to existing active transportation facilities, contact the TRPA transportation department or the local agency with jurisdiction over the project site for additional instruction. Review the Complete Street Resource Guide for design considerations. Yes No c. If the project includes construction of a shared-use path, does the path include permanent counting equipment? If yes, please describe. Note that "shared-use path" is defined as a paved, off-road facility designed for travel by a variety of nonmotorized users, including bicyclists, pedestrians, skaters, joggers, and others. Please contact the TRPA transportation department for information on permanent counting equipment. Yes

d.	Does the project proposal incorporate end-of-trip active transportation facilities? If yes, please describe. Note that "end-of-trip active transportation facilities" are defined as designated places that support bicyclists, joggers, and walkers in using alternative ways to travel to work rather than driving or taking public transit. These types of facilities also benefit people who exercise during their lunch break and might include secure bicycle parking, water fountains, benches, locker facilities, showers, and restrooms. A full list of possible end-of-trip active transportation facilities at commercial, tourist, recreational, transit, lodging, and government centers is included in the attached ATP Checklist Reference Sheet page under Policy 4.5 of the 2016 Active Transportation Plan. X Yes
	New sidewalk along Lake Parkway adjacent to project site and bicycle parking for residents and guests
	No
<u>V.</u>	EDUCATION, ENCOURAGEMENT, EVALUATION, AND ENFORCEMENT PROGRAMMING:
a.	Does the project include active transportation wayfinding? If yes, please describe. Note that "wayfinding" refers to information systems that guide people through a physical environment and enhance their understanding and experience of the space (ex: visual cues that direct travelers, such as maps and traffic signs). If the project site is privately owned and includes or is near a public active transportation facility, contact your local agency to identify the recommended wayfinding signage for the project. If the project site is government-owned and is part of the Tahoe Trail around the lake, contact TRPA transportation department to obtain the appropriate signage information.
	For a general understanding of the Region's wayfinding signage design guidelines, please review pages 77-81 of the Complete Street Resource Guide and the State Route 28 National Scenic Byway Corridor Signage Master Plan. • Complete Street Resource Guide
	State Route 28 National Scenic Byway Corridor Signage Master Plan Yes
	X No

ATP CHECKLIST REFERENCE SHEET

ATP Policy 3.1: "Create convenient intermodal connectivity which considers first and last mile facility needs and connects all modal options by providing necessary infrastructure and schedule coordination."

	ATP Policy 3.1 Implementation Examples
	Include bus stop facilities such as bus schedules, route maps, bike racks, benches and lighting for safety if a bus stop is within 300 feet of the project location.
	 Information kiosks that provide real-time bus schedule and route data, such as a monitor that displays bus arrival times.
Commercial	 Incorporate sidewalk planters, trees, or other greenery to encourage walking and separate pedestrians from the street.
	 Include sidewalks, bike paths, and wayfinding signage in the project to connect users to existing pedestrian and bicycle networks in the Region.
	• Provide fix-it stations for bicycle rehab such as air pump and hand tools.
	• Include a bike sharing station on-site if deemed an appropriate location.
	 Include bus stop facilities such as bus schedules, route maps, bike racks, benches and lighting for safety if a bus stop is within 300 feet of the project location.
Multi-Family	 Include sidewalks, bike paths, and wayfinding signage in the project to connect users to existing pedestrian and bicycle networks in the Region.
	 Consider unbundling parking with unit rent costs so tenants must pay for a parking permit or an additional monthly parking fee. Include free bus pass, secure indoor bike parking, and on-site fix-it stations with rental unit.
	Include a bike sharing station on-site if deemed an appropriate location.
	 Include bus stop facilities such as bus schedules, route maps, bike racks, benches and lighting for safety if a bus stop is within 300 feet of the project location.
Public Service	 Include sidewalks, bike paths, and wayfinding signage in the project to connect users to existing pedestrian and bicycle networks in the Region.
	 Provide fix-it stations for bicycle rehab such as air pump and hand tools.
	 Include bus stop facilities such as bus schedules, route maps, bike racks, benches and lighting for safety if a bus stop is within 300 feet of the project location.
	 Information kiosks that provide real-time bus schedule and route data, such as a monitor that displays bus arrival times.
Recreation	 Include sidewalks, bike paths, and wayfinding signage in the project to connect users to existing pedestrian and bicycle networks in the Region.
	• Provide fix-it stations for bicycle rehab such as air pump and hand tools.
	Include a bike sharing station on-site if deemed an appropriate location

ATP Policy 4.5: "During project planning and permit approval, identify and address the need for support and end-of-trip active transportation facilities including bicycle parking, water fountains, benches, and restrooms at commercial, tourist, recreation, transit, lodging, and government centers."

	ATP Policy 4.5 Implementation Examples
Commercial	 Provide secure covered or indoor bike parking facilities in well-lit areas with high visibility to ensure visitors can safely store their bikes at the project site during their visit. If this is not feasible, consider coordinating with your local government to implement unconventional bike parking infrastructure, such as attaching Cyclehoops to railings, street signs, parking meters, etc. Provide water fountains, locker rooms, and showers to accommodate employees who commute to work by bike.
	Provide fix-it stations for bicycle rehab such as air pump and hand tools.
	 Information kiosks that provide real-time bus schedule and route data, such as a monitor that displays bus arrival times.
Multi-Family	 Provide secure covered bike parking in well-lit areas with high visibility to ensure residents and visitors can safely store their bikes at the project site. Provide secure in-door bike parking facility that only residents can access.
Public Service	 Provide secure covered or indoor bike parking facilities in well-lit areas with high visibility to ensure visitors can safely store their bikes at the project site during their visit. If this is not feasible, consider coordinating with your local government to implement unconventional bike parking infrastructure, such as attaching Cyclehoops to railings, street signs, parking meters, etc. Provide water fountains, locker rooms, and showers to accommodate employees who commute to work by bike. Provide fix-it stations for bicycle rehab such as air pump and hand tools.

	-
Recreation	 Provide secure bike parking in well-lit areas, with high visibility to ensure visitors can safely store their bikes at the project site while recreating. If this is not feasible, consider coordinating with your local government to implement unconventional bike parking infrastructure, such as attaching Cyclehoops to railings, street signs, parking meters, etc. Provide water fountains and restrooms. Provide benches and picnic tables to allow visitors to rest during their visit. Provide fix-it stations for bicycle rehab such as air pump and hand tools. Information kiosks that provide real-time bus schedule and route data,
	such as a monitor that displays bus arrival times.
	 Provide secure covered bike parking in well-lit areas with high visibility to ensure visitors can safely store their bikes at the project site during their visit. If this is not feasible, consider coordinating with your local government to implement unconventional bike parking infrastructure, such as attaching Cyclehoops to railings, street signs, parking meters, etc.
Tourist Accommodation	 Provide water fountains, benches, and information kiosks at the project site to increase the appeal of biking in the Region to tourists.
	 Provide water fountains, locker rooms, and showers to accommodate employees who commute to work by bike.
	• Provide fix-it stations for bicycle rehab such as air pump and hand tools.
	 Information kiosks that provide real-time bus schedule and route data, such as a monitor that displays bus arrival times.